# THE GREEKS AND THE BLACK SEA from the Bronze Age to the early twentieth century

Marianna Koromila



Contributions by

Alexander Alexidze ~ Otar Lordkipanidze Anna Ballian ~ Louisa Polychronidou-Loukopoulou Petros N. Protonotarios

The PANORAMA CULTURAL SOCIETY ATHENS 2002

## Contents

FOREWORD From the first to the second edition, spring 1991 - autumn 2001	10
INTRODUCTION The blades of Mycenaean swords and the persistence of hallowed place names	15
CHAPTER I The Axenos Pontus	17-51
CHAPTER II The Propontis or the Sea of Marmara Byzantion-Constantinople: topography of the environs Constantinople: the dual-natured City of Constantine the Great 73	53-74 66
CHAPTER III The Polyonymous Thracian Bosphoros	75-81
CHAPTER IV The Euxine Pontus The River Danube: the ultimate frontier Sacred Istros and distant Istria 102	83-314 93
From the Istros-Danube to the Bosphoros Travelling along the Euxine horizon of the Thracian shore 112 ~ Exhausted cities, perished materials, enduring memory: Apollonia-Sozopolis and Mesembria 124 ~ Anchiale, Anchialos and Achelo: a city burnt to cinders 146 ~ Penetration of the heartland of Thrace and the early Hellenization of the ancient Thracians 148 ~ Alexander the Great on the Danube 151 ~ Ionian Tomis, Byzantine Constantia-Constantiniana (modern Constantza) 157 ~ The Early Byzantine <i>Dioecesis Thraciae</i> 163 ~ The Byzantine border and the defence of the Black Sea end of the Danube 164	109
The dark ages	166
From the Danube Delta to the Greater Caucasus: the Euxine North In the nameless and much-traversed wilderness of the Scythian steppe 179 ~ Olbia, the most fortunate city of the North 195 ~ The Crimean Peninsula 211 ~ The Cimmerian Bosporos, Pantikapaion and Bosporian 'polynesia': the Straits of Kerch 216 ~ The Sea of Azov 224 ~ Byzantine Cherson 231	176
The mountain walls of the Euxine South: Pontos	243
The Euxine Far East: Caucasia	284 288
ALEXANDER ALEXIDZE, Martha-Maria: An outstanding personality in the cultural history of Georgia and Byzantium	306

CHAPTER V The Black Sea (1453-1829)	315-370
Constantinople 319 ~ Wallachia and Moldavia 330 ~ 'Byzance après Byzance' 331 ~ From the	
Moldavian Plain to the Pontic Alps 335 ANNA BALLIAN, Argyroupolis – Gümüşhane (translated by John Leatham) Expatriation 350 ~ Like migratory birds 359 ~ Josipos's 'Greece' and Smaragda's 'Home- land' 365 ~ Superbia Graecorum and the Greek Idea, Russian Expansion and the Tsarina's 'Euxine Pontus' dream 367	339
CHAPTER VI The Golden Fleece	371-418 396
Greek Education under the aegis, leadership and supervision of the Ecumenical Patriarchate 399 $\sim$ The last splendour of the Euxine Sea world 407 $\sim$ The Russian Governorate of Kars (1878-1918) and the 75,000 Pontian 'Karslídes' 410 $\sim$ The Inhospitable Sea: Axenos Pontus 412	
APPENDIX I PETROS N. PROTONOTARIOS, The Mint of the Empire of Trebizond	420
Appendix II	
Danubian Braila (translated by Kay Cicellis)	427
FOREWORD TO THE FIRST EDITION (1991)	436
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	438
INDEX OF MAPS	440
BIBLIOGRAPHY AND NOTES (translated by Caroline Robinson)	441
INDEX (translated by Caroline Robinson)	465



Fig. 268. Gold-embroidered banner (*labarum*) with the icon of Saint George the Dragon-slayer, dated 1731. Donated by Hadji Soumelidis Zamanos and signed by the Trapezuntine embroideress Theodosia Kasimbouri.

### Argyroupolis – Gümüşhane: mining capital of Pontos

#### by Anna Ballian

The founding and the heyday of the City of Silver, Gümüşhane, are bound closely to the exploitation of the mineral wealth of Pontos and to the administrative organization of mines in the Ottoman Empire. Pontos had been known for its metals ever since Antiquity. Documentary sources from the period of the Grand Komnenoi indicate that the region was at that time self-sufficient in metals and Trebizond was the centre of silverware production. Early Ottoman sources confirm this state of affairs and clearly show that mining and metalworking were among the most important occupations of the Pontian Greeks.

The discovery of silver-bearing ore at the Byzantine fortress of Tzanicha, known as Canca to the Ottomans, in the mountainous province of Chaldia, is dated by Greek sources to the early sixteenth century. In accordance with Ottoman practice, a mint was set up close to the mines at Canca in 1546, and the sultan's revenues from the mines were recorded in the Trebizond tax registers of 1553. The mining town, which the local people named initially Kan, was built on the lower slopes of Tzanicha\* fortress; it was first referred to as Gümüşhane in 1598. The Turkish traveller Evliya Çelebi described it in 1644 as rich and populous.

Some of the earliest inhabitants of Gümüşhane came from the surrounding area, others were *paroikoi* (dependent peasants) of the Soumela Monastery, dispatched by the monastery to work in the mines. The same phenomenon is observed in the Balkans, where monasteries held their lands and privileges in exchange for the services they provided in furthering exploitation of the imperial revenues. The city soon attracted a population from the wider region of Pontos, from the shores of the Black Sea, Trebizond, and Lazica. This is largely explained by the fact that Ottoman regulations governing mines granted the mining community tax exemptions and a degree of profit-sharing from their exploitation.

The initial trend for the population to concentrate in Chaldia was succeeded in about the mid-seventeenth century by a reverse movement, in which the population spread out beyond the frontiers of Chaldia and Pontos. Miners moved from one place to another to find new veins for exploitation and created new mining settlements in the process. Following the course of the River Charsites (Kanis), the Chaldian miners established mining colonies along the shores of the Black Sea, expanded into the mining areas around Erzurum and Bayburt, took over the alum mines of Şebinkarahisar (Byzantine Koloneia) and, descending the River Euphrates, settled in Kapan (Keban) and Argana (Ergani) in the region of Diyarbakır. By the eighteenth century, they were widely renowned, and around 1730 they were invited to operate the Ahtala mines, in the *pa*-

[Figs 268-270 and 272-277 are of Refugee Treasures in the Collection of the Exchange of Populations, in the Benaki Museum, Athens, and were photographed specially for the present publication.]

[\* For the location of Tzanicha (Turk. Canca) on the south bank of the Kanis-Charsites (Turk. Harşit), see historical Map 38 of the theme of Chaldia, on p. 272, and plan of the Byzantine fortress on p. 276.] *shalik* of Ahiyka (Akhaltzikhe), where later King Irakli of Georgia granted them the homonymous monastery of Ahtala.

The increasing importance of Gümüşhane is reflected in the ecclesiastical structure of the province of Chaldia. In the mid-sixteenth century the area was under the jurisdiction of the Metropolitan of Trebizond who, conforming with tradition, appointed a descendant of the Byzantine overlords of Tzanicha fortress as *choroepiskopos*, delegate bishop of the mining area. By 1617, the ancient Bishopric of Chaldia had been reestablished, while at some time before 1657 it was raised to an archbishopric and in 1776 to a metropolitan see. Greek sources mention that when the mines were at their peak of activity the town of Gümüşhane alone consisted of ten parishes, six of them Greek with 2,250 families, one Armenian with 180 families, and three Turkish of which one is said to have comprised 200 families.

According to Ottoman mining law, the land belonged to the sultan and its revenues to the imperial treasury. The general administrator of mines was a salaried Muslim official, the *maden emini*. The superintendent of mines was known in Greek as the *archimetallourgos* (literally, 'chief metallurgist'), and in Turkish as *madenci usta başı* (literally, 'chief master miner'). The superintendent was a Christian – a Greek, except on one occasion when he was an Armenian. He was chosen from among the 'chief metallurgists' of the local mines. Miners were exempted from the taxes Christians normally paid and were looked upon as privileged subjects of the sultan. The villages and districts that provided such services as transportation and the supply of charcoal, or the guarding of the mines were subject to the jurisdiction of the laws concerning mines and were independent of the local Ottoman authorities.

The relationship between the Muslim *maden emini* and the Christian superintendent determined the development of the mining community. In the seventeenth century, one of the local Ottoman lords, known as *timar*-holders or *derebeys*, was appointed *maden emini*; it was his responsibility to choose the superintendent. But it was the master miners themselves who exercised effective control over the product of the mines. Conflict was inevitable.

In 1649, the local *timar*-holders appointed the Armenian Sanoz, in an attempt to break the power of the Greek master miners; however, Sanoz was accused of embezzlement and was hanged. There followed the assassination of three superintendents, all members of the Sarasitis family, while one archbishop, Euthymios Phytianos, was compelled to renounce his see. Finally, when the superintendent Ioannis Sarasitis was murdered in the centre of the goldsmiths' market in 1722, men of local standing in Chaldia sent their representative, Hadji Soumelidis Zamanos, to the sultan's court. He succeeded in securing a more favourable regime for the mines, which accorded with the administrative reforms being introduced at the time in the Ottoman Empire. After 1722, it was an official of

the sultan's court who was appointed *maden emini*, while the superintendent was chosen with the consent of the Christian master miners. His appointment was ratified by the sultan in person at a special ceremony, in the course of which the master miner so chosen was formally presented with a robe of honour and a sword.

During the eighteenth century the Gümüşhane mines and the mines associated with them were the most important source of metals in the Ottoman Empire. The administrative reforms favoured more intensive exploitation, though reduced production from Balkan mines must also have been a contributory factor. In 1644, Evliya Çelebi noted that the imperial treasury was enriched each year by the amount of 7,000 kilograms of silver from Gümüşhane alone, while in 1742, Ergani, which had a steady output throughout the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, produced a total of 3,940 kilograms of pure silver.

Local autonomy and material prosperity were reflected mainly in the patronage given to the arts and letters. In the eighteenth century, the churches of Gümüşhane were enlarged, rebuilt, and decorated with wallpaintings – and, of course, they were endowed with liturgical vessels of brightly polished silver. The rebuilding of the cathedral church of the archbishopric was completed in 1726, and in 1730 a Greek school was founded on the initiative of Archbishop Ignatios Phytianos. Outstanding pupils were sent to study in Constantinople or to the great centre of Greek and Orthodox education, Wallachia, where many Greeks from Pontos had established themselves and were active. Foremost among the notables and patrons of the arts were, of course, the master miners, but it was the head of the local religious establishment, the archbishop, who set the tone. Gümüşhane became the focal point of an early renaissance of Hellenism in Pontos, of which the dominant features were local tradition and Orthodoxy.

The 'blessed mines' of Chaldia exerted a great influence over the Orthodox community which expressed itself in financial support for patriarchs, metropolitans, bishops, and monks making tours. Donations made by the people of Pontos to the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem fill an entire codex.

The natural consequence of the undoubted supremacy of Chaldia was the authoritative manner in which it was exercised. Perhaps the most characteristic and amply documented manifestation of the power of the mines was the extension of the ecclesiastical jurisdiction of the See of Chaldia. The Chaldian church followed everywhere in the footsteps of members of its flock as they moved from place to place and established new mining settlements. The diaspora of the Pontian miners owed spiritual submission and rights exclusively to its own prelates. This order of things, an irregular one in terms of canon law, brought the Archbishop of



Fig. 269. Carved wooden pectoral with silver-gilt and enamelled case, 1736. Dedicated by Michail Sarasitis, son of Ioannis.

Chaldia into conflict with the prelacy of the districts where the miners had settled: the metropolitans of Trebizond, Theodosioupolis (Erzurum), Neokaisareia (Niksar), and Amida (Diyarbakır), and the Patriarch of Antioch. Invariably Chaldia managed to prevail (for money talks), with the help of the general master miners who were well connected at the sultan's court. In the case of a severe dispute, such as the one that occurred with the Metropolitan of Trebizond, the miners of Chaldia, from the Black Sea to Diyarbakır, threatened to lay down their tools.

The dispute with the Metropolitan of Trebizond had deeper roots, for in effect the Archbishop of Chaldia was denying him his natural position as leader of the Pontian Greeks. It was characteristic of the times that in 1733 Ignatios Phytianos, Archbishop of Chaldia, was appointed exarch of the Soumela monastery, and not the Metropolitan of Trebizond. The monastery's bonds with the City of Silver were bonds of both spiritual kinship and financial dependence. Ignatios Phytianos was descended from a family of Soumeliot *paroikoi*, and had studied in Wallachia with monastic encouragement. He himself, and his successors, had the overriding moral obligation to protect and increase the monastery's spiritual influence.

The development of Gümüşhane was determined by the limits set upon the mining of metals by the technology of the age. Towards the end of the eighteenth century the Chaldian ore deposits began to show signs of exhaustion, but Gümüşhane's ascendancy was maintained by virtue of the production of its mining dependencies. The diaspora of the Pontian people spread ever wider. Mining colonies were established mainly in central Asia Minor: Akdağmaden, Sim (Gümüşhaciköy), Keskin (Denekmaden) and, in the Taurus region: Bulgarmaden and Bereketlimaden.

The greater part of the dispersion occurred as a consequence of the two Russo-Turkish wars, fought in 1828 and 1877-1878, the migrants moving to Kars, to Tsalka and Batum in Georgia, and to Stavroupolis (Stavropol') in South Russia, the trek ending in the Danubian lands. Chaldia was almost emptied of its human content, just as it had been depleted of its metal-bearing ores and firewood.

The Tanzimat reforms brought about the final abolition of the privileges enjoyed by the master miners. There remained the prestige of the Metropolitan of Chaldia and the wealth of silver offerings in the churches. A part of this wealth was melted down in 1871, to pay for the new school in the town, by now renamed Argyroupolis, a direct translation of the Turkish Gümüşhane, at the instigation of the younger generation of Pontian teachers who had studied in Athens.



Fig. 270. Benedictory cross of carved wood in silver-gilt and enamelled setting, first half of 18th c.

Anna Ballian Art Historian Keeper, Benaki Museum



[Fig. 271. Argyroupolis, 115 km. south of Trebizond: ruins of the metropolitan cathedral of Saint George. The large, three-aisled basilica, built in 1724-1726, retains scant traces of wall-paintings on the west wall of the south aisle.

Among the treasures of Saint George were the banner (Fig. 268), the pectoral (Fig. 269) and the chalice (Fig. 273).]

[Old Argyroupolis (Eski Gümüşhane) was gradually abandoned in the course of the nineteenth century. The new town, Yeni Gümüşhane, was built a few kilometres to the east on the caravan route linking the Black Sea with the Armenian Plateau, central and southern Asia Minor, the Middle East, Persia and the Caucasus.

The now forlorn city, a vast ruin tucked away in the metal-bearing mountain, was built some way back from the main road, for protection.

The workshops and shops in the centre of the deserted city, the town hall and the *Phrontisterion* (high school), founded in 1730, the churches, monastic dependencies (*metochia*) and rock-hewn chapels, the two-storey houses – shells and foundations of what was once a thriving urban centre, home to 2,225 Greek, 200 Turkish and 180 Armenian families – now lie exposed to the elements.

The Treaty of Lausanne (signed on 20 January 1923) and the consequent compulsory Exchange of Populations between Greece and Turkey provoked the last phase of the great 'Exodus'. Pontian refugees carried to Greece as many of the treasures from the churches and monasteries of their homeland as possible. The treasures from Argyroupolis are deposited in the Benaki Museum in Athens. They provide telling evidence of the cultural and economic vigour of the City of Silver.]



Fig. 272. A pair of silver-gilt liturgical fans (*hexapteryga*).Argyroupolis (Gümüşhane), 1745.H. 50 cm., diam. 32.5 cm.

Rivetted to the centre of the pierced-work disc of each fan is a large boss, each face of which is decorated with religious scenes in repoussé. On one of the fans is depicted the Crucifixion and the Resurrection, on the other the Dormition of the Mother of God and the Fountain of Life (*Zoodochos Pege*).

Veneration of the Zoodochos Pege was of Constantinopolitan origin and its incidence increased after 1727, the year in which repairs were carried out to the old Byzantine *hagiasma* (pool of miraculous waters) at Balıklı outside the Selymbria Gate; as a natural consequence of this, the iconographic type became more widespread. It is represented here in the austere form encountered in seventeenth-century icons, with the Virgin in bust emerging from the water basin (the *phiale*), around which stand pilgrims healed by its waters. The scene is dominated by the man possessed by a devil at the very moment the evil spirit is escaping from his mouth. The pierced-work vegetal motifs with hatched details derive from prototypes originating in the capital; essentially they imitate European silverwork, especially the decoration of valuable watch-cases much in vogue in seventeenth-century Constantinople. The style is common to articles produced by both Muslim and Christian craftsmen, but was especially associated with liturgical fans, which traditionally comprised pierced-work discs with interlaced floral motifs.

The niello inscription on the shafts reads: 'These *hexapteryga* have been dedicated by the Most Holy Archbishop of Chaldia, Lord Ignatios, to the All-Holy Virgin Kaniotissa for the salvation of the soul of his parents Dimitrios Proskynites and Eugenia, in the year of the Saviour 1745, in the month of March. The work of Ioannis son of Georgios Konstatas'.

The Virgin Kaniotissa is the church of the Dormition of the Mother of God at Kan, that is Gümüşhane. Archbishop Ignatios II, born Kouthouris, (1734-1749), was descended from one of the first families of settlers. His early ecclesiastical training was received at the Soumela Monastery; he completed his studies in Jerusalem under Patriarch Dositheos Notaras. In 1744, he met the cost of the wall-paintings in the forecourt of the Soumela Monastery. (Benaki Museum, inv. no. TA 231)



Fig. 273. Silver-gilt chalice with cover. Argyroupolis (Gümüşhane), 1726; the cover is dated 1727. H. 50 cm.

This slender chalice, of typical European shape, is richly decorated with repoussé religious scenes. The European influence is also evident in the scattered heads of cherubim, recalling Venetian chalices, and also in the pierced-work open flowers, a motif of European ornamentation. The goldsmith's Ottoman milieu is apparent in details such as the cypress trees and the settings of the coloured stones. The craftsman signed his name in the traditional Byzantine manner: '[by the] hand of the goldsmith Georgios'. The feature directly associated with the usual Byzantine chalice is the hymn, central to the Holy Communion service, inscribed in niello around the rim: 'Drink ye all of it; for this is my blood of the New Testament, which is shed for you and for many'.

The enthroned Christ, the Virgin, Saint John, and the Crucifixion are represented on the main body of the chalice, and busts of the Apostles and the Evangelists on the foot. The scenes on the cover, of the Hospitality of Abraham, the Baptism, the Last Supper, and the Resurrection, enrich the iconography and stress the donor's intention that his gift should be something out of the ordinary. The dedicatory inscriptions read: on the foot, 'Dedicated to the Most Holy and Most Lauded church of Saint George in Chaldia for the salvation of the soul of the servant of God, Stephanos Phytianos and of his wife and parents, 1726'; on the cover, 'Dedicated to the church of Saint George by the same Stephanos Phytianos, 1727'.

Stephanos Phytianos was 'chief metallurgist' of the rich mining area of Torul in Chaldia and an influential person in the mining community. He made donations towards the cost of repairs to the Choutoura Monastery, the founding of a church in Phytiana, and the establishment of a school in Argyroupolis. The surname Phytianos indicates his place of origin, the village of Phytiana in Torul, famed birthplace of many 'chief metallurgists' and churchmen. The village is referred to as Beşkilise or Başkilise, meaning 'five churches' or 'head of the church' respectively in Turkish, in view of the fact that one patriarch, eight metropolitans, and five abbots all hailed from there. (Benaki Museum, inv. no. TA 170)



Fig. 274. Silver rose-water sprinkler with gilding. Argyroupolis (Gümüşhane), 1735. H. 25.8 cm.

The sprinkler is shaped like most Islamic sprinklers, with a slender neck that screws on to the spherical body surmounted by a small ribbed ring. The decoration is in repoussé on a ring-punched ground and comprises cypress trees, heraldic peacocks, birds, and five medallions with the busts of Christ, the Virgin, Saint John the Baptist, and the Archangels Michael and Gabriel.

Inscriptions: '+ Property of Nikolaos, Lord of the Monasteries, son of Theodoros. In the year of Christ 1735'. *Lord of the Monasteries* was the title of one of the officials in the Patriarchate of Constantinople, which in Ottoman times was also conferred by local hierarchs upon leading members of the community. Nikolaos was apparently responsible for the Pontic monasteries subject to the Archbishopric of Chaldia, and is known from his appearance as witness to a deed of gift to the Holy Sepulchre 'of six workshops directly opposite the co-operative furnaces' of Gümüshane.

In the sixteenth century the Greek goldsmiths of Trebizond were renowned for their skills, and it was in Trebizond that the two great sultans, Selim I and Süleyman the Magnificent, learnt the goldsmith's craft. According to Evliya Çelebi, the craftsmen of Trebizond were especially noted for the fine sprinklers and flasks they produced. The oldest known example is dated 1670 and once belonged to the metropolitan church of Trebizond. The tradition of making sprinklers as well as other articles of silverware persisted into the eighteenth century at Gümüşhane, where goldsmiths' workshops formed a market-place of their own in the centre of the city. (Benaki Museum, inv. no. TA 460)



Fig. 275. Benedictory cross of carved wood mounted in a silver-gilt and enamelled frame. Choutoura Monastery, Chaldia, 1700. H. 23.9 cm.

Carved wooden crosses were usually of monastic workmanship, Mount Athos being the earliest and most important centre of production. Represented on the Choutoura Monastery cross are scenes of the Twelve Great Feasts of the Church (Dodecaorton) within the recesses of an architectural frame. The mount has polychrome cloisonné enamels, pearls, and semiprecious or paste gems in the style of seventeenth-century crosses common in the Balkans and mainland Greece. The winged and crested dragons standing either side of it on two short legs, of cast silver decorated with champlevé enamel, are akin to sixteenth-century silverware from the same region.

New decorative trends must have been transmitted to Pontos via the capital, where there had been a Pontian community of goldsmiths and coppersmiths since at least the late sixteenth century. It may be noted that Symeon the Goldsmith (Chrysochoos), a neo-Martyr from Trebizond, was put to death in Constantinople in the mid-seventeenth century, and that before the Exchange of Populations, in 1924, the coppersmiths of the capital were almost exclusively Pontian Greeks.

The inscription on the body of the dragons reads: 'Akakios, hieromonk of Choutoura Monastery, 1700'.

The foremost monastery in the province of Chaldia, Choutoura lay very close to Argyroupolis and was under the high patronage of the 'chief metallurgists' and the archbishops. It was probably first founded in the time of the Grand Komnenoi; its re-founding around the beginning of the seventeenth century, however, was directly connected with the exploitation of the mines in the district and with the founding of Gümüşhane. (Benaki Museum, inv. no. TA 185)



Fig. 276. Gospelbook with silver-gilt cover. Argyroupolis (Gümüşhane), c. 1756-1765. H. 34 cm., w. 25 cm.

The Gospelbook was printed in Venice in 1728. The type of repoussé cover is characteristic of Argyroupolis silverwork, a style found also beyond the frontiers of Chaldia and her mining colonies, in places such as the monastery at Elegmoi in Bithynia, the Bačkovo Monastery in the northern foothills of the Rhodope Mountains, and the Chozoviotissa Monastery on Amorgos.

Analysis of details of the ornamentation illustrates the selective tendency of Argyroupolis goldsmiths. The design follows that of the Islamic type of book cover with a central medallion and corner pieces. The scenes of the Descent into Hell and the Elevation of the Holy Cross are in the post-Byzantine iconographic tradition, but the large full-blown flowers betray the influence of Central European Baroque.

These motifs reached Chaldia via Transylvania and Wallachia. One of the treasures of the archiepiscopal church of Argyroupolis was a small Bible with silver-gilt cover signed by the master craftsman of Sibiu, Sebastian Hann. The cast metal clasps on the Gospelbook are exact copies of the clasps made by Hann.

The dedication is inscribed on the scrolls held by the Prophets: 'Phernes Apostolos, [son] of Rvanta (?) dedicated the Gospelbook to the (church of the) Holy and Life-Giving Cross'. An entry in the codex of the church of the Dormition of the Mother of God in Argyroupolis states that between 1756 and 1765 Apostolos Phernes donated 167 silver dirhems. It was probably during these years that he dedicated the Gospelbook and its cover to the church of the Holy Cross. (Benaki Museum, inv. no. TA 498)



Fig. 277. Icon of Saint Gregory of Nyssa, embroidered with gold thread.Trebizond, late 17th c.H. 62.5 cm., w. 42.5 cm.

The icon of Saint Gregory of Nyssa, depicted seated on a throne at the centre, is embroidered on a dark red silk ground with gold and silver wire. Represented in the upper zone is the Deesis, with Christ as Great High Priest flanked by the Virgin, Saint John the Baptist, and two archangels. In the lower zone are four hierarchs and at the sides four saints. The latter – Saint Andrew, Saint Paraskevi, Saint Kyriaki, and Saint Anastasia the Deliverer from Poison (Pharmakolytria) – correspond to the side-chapels of the metropolitan church of Trebizond, each of which is dedicated to one of them. The lay-out of the decoration is reminiscent of icons of saints surrounded by scenes from their life; however, the single figures of saints under an arcade is a typical feature of Byzantine and post-Byzantine metalwork. Church embroidery draws upon painting for its iconographic models but, from a technical point of view, the gold or silver thread and the scenes rendered in low relief are in direct imitation of silverwork.

In 1665, at a time when tension and persecution were rife in Pontos, the metropolitan church of Saint Philip of Trebizond was sacked by Muslims and in 1674 it was converted into a small mosque. The persecutions resulted in the flight of many Christians to mountainous Chaldia, where they manned the ore mines. The icon was embroidered for the new metropolitan church of Saint Gregory of Nyssa. It is the earliest of a number of examples that prove the existence in Trebizond of a workshop producing church embroideries. (Benaki Museum, inv. no. TA 40)

## Extract from the General Bibliography (pp. 441-464) pp. 459-461

## Argyroupolis-Gümüşhane (Ballian's article pp. 338-349)

**For Argyroupolis and its mines, see:** G.T. Kandilaptis, Οί Άρχιμεταλλουργοὶ τοῦ Πόντου καὶ τὸ Ἐθνικὸν Ἐργον Αὐτῶν (Alexandroupolis 1929); D. Oikonomidis, ʿἈργυϱόπολις', in Ἀρχεῖον Πόντου (hereafter AP) 3 (1931), pp. 145-194; G.T. Kandilaptis, ʿἩ Ἀργυϱόπολις τοῦ Πόντου', Ποντιακὴ Ἐστία 5 (1954), pp. 2445-47, 2567-69, 2637-39, 2752-54, 2901-3; A. Bryer and D. Winfield, 'Nineteenth-Century Monuments in the City and Vilayet of Trebizond: Architectural and Historical Notes', AP 30 (1970/71), pp. 324-349; Gülyüz (Akagün) Uslu, *Gümüşhane ve Çevresinin Tarihi-Sanat Eserleri* (Istanbul 1980); A. Bryer, 'The Question of Byzantine Mines in the Pontos: Chalybian Iron, Chaldian Silver, Koloneian Alum and the Mummy of Cheriana', Anatolian Studies 32 (1982), pp. 133-150; A. Bryer, 'The Crypto-Christians of the Pontos', Δελτίον τοῦ Κέντρου Μικρασιατικῶν Σπουδῶν (hereafter DKMS) 4 (1983), pp. 13-68.

For Ottoman sources concerning Pontos and the mines: Evliya Efendi, Narrative of Travels in Europe, Asia and Africa, trans. J. von Hammer, vol. Il (London 1850), p. 220; A. Refik, Osmanli Devrinde Türkiye Madenleri (967-1200) (Istanbul 1931); T. Gökbilgin, 'XVI. Yüzyil Başlarında Trabzon Livasi ve Doğu Karadeniz Bölgesi', Belleten 26 (1962), pp. 293-337, trans. Evangelia Balta, in DKMS 2 (1980), pp. 121-182; A. Bryer and H. Lowry (eds), Continuity and Change in Late Byzantine and Early Ottoman Society (Birmingham, Washington D.C. 1968), chapter II, and especially R. Jennings, 'The Society and Economy of Maçuka in the Ottoman Judicial Registers of Trabzon, 1560-1640', pp. 129-154.

**For Ottoman mining law and administration:** R. Anhegger, *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Bergbaus im Osmanischen Reich*. I *Europäische Türkei* (Istanbul 1943-44); N. Beldiceanu, *Les actes des premiers Sultans conservés dans les manuscripts turcs de la Bibliothèque nationale à Paris*. Vol. II, *Réglements miniers* 1390-1512 (Paris, The Hague 1964); R. Murphey, s.v. Ma'din in *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2nd edition (hereafter *EI*<sup>2</sup>), pp. 973-985. The administrative reform of 1722, referred to in the Greek sources as the work of the *kotzabasi* (village elder) Chatzis Soumelidis Zamanos, concerned the farming out of mine revenues according to the *malikane* system; see I. Beldiceanu-Steinherr, *s.v. malikane* in *EI*<sup>2</sup>, pp. 262-263. The term *beylikci* was also used in Balkan mines, see: Beldiceanu, *Réglements miniers*, p. 87. The term  $\zeta \epsilon \beta \alpha \dot{\alpha} \tau$ , used by Kandilaptis to describe the districts enjoying mining protection, should probably be identified with *zevaid*, cf. Gökbilgin-Balta, *DKMS* 2 (1980), p. 160, n. 161.

For the ecclesiastical history of the See of Chaldia: C. Myridis "Η Οἰκογένεια τῶν Σαφασιτῶν καὶ ὁ Γεφβάσιος Σαφασίτης', *AP* 7 (1937), pp. 3-82; A.A. Papadopoulos, "Ιστοφικὰ Σημειώματα ἐκ τοῦ Κώδικος τῆς Ἐπαφχίας Χαλδίας', *AP* 8 (1938), pp. 18-58; A.A. Papadopoulos, Ὁ Χαλδίας Ἀφχιεφεὺς τῶν Μεταλλουφγῶν', *AP* 13 (1948), pp. 49-60; N. Veis, `Ἀφιεφώματα καὶ λειτουφγικαὶ συνδφομαὶ Τφαπεζουντίων καὶ ἄλλων Ποντίων ὑπὲφ τοῦ Παναγίου Τάφου κατ' ἀναγφαφὰς Ἱεφοσολυμιτικοῦ κώδικος', *AP* 14 (1949), pp. 124-160; G.T. Kandilaptis, `Συμβολὴ εἰς μελέτην πεφὶ τῆς Μητφοπόλεως Χαλδίας', *AP* 14 (1949), pp. 42-63, and *AP* 15 (1950), pp. 84-97; Ὁ Κῶδιξ τοῦ ἐν Ἀφγυφοπόλεως Χαλδίας' Κοιμήσεως τῆς Θεοτόκου', *AP* 24 (1961), pp. 135-160; `Κατάλογος Κωδίκων τοῦ Ἑλληνικοῦ Φφοντιστηφίου Ἀφγυφοπόλεως', *AP* 27 (1966), pp. 105-127, and `Κατάλογος Κωδίκων', *AP* 28 (1967), pp. 124-151.

For the paroikoi of the Soumela Monastery: E.T. Kyriakidis,  $I\sigma\tau o\rho (\alpha \tau \eta \zeta \pi \alpha \rho \dot{\alpha} \tau \dot{\eta} \nu T \rho \alpha \pi \varepsilon \zeta o \bar{v} \nu \tau \alpha T \varepsilon \rho \alpha \zeta B \alpha \sigma \iota \lambda \iota \kappa \eta \zeta \Pi \alpha \tau \rho \iota \alpha \rho \chi \iota \kappa \eta \zeta \Sigma \tau \alpha v \rho \sigma \eta \eta \iota \alpha \kappa \eta \zeta Mov \eta \zeta \tau \eta \zeta \Upsilon \pi \varepsilon \rho \alpha \gamma (\alpha \zeta \Theta \varepsilon \sigma \tau \delta \kappa \sigma \tau \tau \eta \zeta \Sigma o \nu \mu \varepsilon \lambda \dot{\alpha}$  (Athens 1898), pp. 72-73; G.T. Kandilaptis,  $\Pi o \nu \tau \iota \alpha \kappa \eta E \sigma \tau (\alpha 5 (1954), pp. 2567-69; cf. Beldiceanu,$ *Réglements miniers*, p. 103.

**For mining settlements in the See of Trebizond:** Chrysanthos, Metropolitan of Trebizond, "Η Ἐκκλησία Τǫαπεζοῦντος', *AP* 4-5 (1933), p. 582 ff; A.A. Papadopoulos, *AP* 13 (1948), pp. 49-60; G.T. Kandilaptis, AP 14 (1949), pp. 42-58, and AP 15 (1950), pp. 88-91. For the See of Theodosioupolis (Erzurum): Chrysanthos, AP 4-5 (1933), pp. 157-158, pp. 576-577; G.T. Kandilaptis, AP 14 (1949), p. 50. For the See of Neokaisareia: Gabriel Premetidos, Metropolitan of Koloneia,  $H M\eta\tau\rho\delta\pi\sigma\lambda\iota\varsigma$  Ko $\lambda\omega\nu\epsilon\iota\alpha\varsigma$  (Thessaloniki 1987), pp. 114-119; C. Lioudaki-Kypraiou, Μεταλλεία τῆς Μικρασίας και τοῦ Πόντου (Athens 1982), pp. 99-100; G.T. Kandilaptis, AP 14 (1949), pp. 59-63. For the See of Amida (Diyarbekir): Chrysanthos, AP 4-5 (1933), pp. 607-609; A.A. Papadopoulos, AP 13 (1948), pp. 56-60; G.T. Kandilaptis, AP 15 (1950), pp. 85-88; C. Lioudaki-Kypraiou,  $M \varepsilon \tau \alpha \lambda \lambda \varepsilon i \alpha$ , pp. 105-112. Evidence of an early colonization of Argana is provided by the 1624 refounding document of the Choutoura Monastery: A.A. Papadopoulos, AP 8 (1938), p. 53. By 1686 the church of Saints Kosmas and Damian in Diyarbekir was under the jurisdiction of Chaldian master miners, to which a copper font in the Benaki Museum attests. See: Evgenia Chatzidaki, `Χριστιανικές Έπιγραφὲς τῆς Μικρᾶς Ἀσίας καὶ τοῦ Πόντου', Μικρασιατικὰ Χρονικὰ (hereafter MCh) 8 (1959), 4 no. 10; cf. M. van Berchem and J. Strzygowski, Amida, (Heidelberg 1910), pp. 176-183. For the mines in Georgia: Chrysanthos, AP 4-5 (1933), p. 596; I.E. Kalphoglou,  $Oi (E\lambda\lambda\eta\nu\varepsilon\zeta \dot{\epsilon}\nu$ Kαυκάσω (Athens 1908), pp. 92, 106-8; D. Marshall Lang, The Last Years of the Georgian Monarchy 1658-1882 (New York 1957), pp. 195-196.

**For the expansion of the ecclesiastical jurisdiction of Chaldia,** cf. a similar case in the iron mines of Samakov/Samokov in Bulgaria: M. Kiel, *Art and Society in Bulgaria in the Turkish Period* (Assen/Maastricht 1958), pp. 125-126.

**For relations with Wallachia:** C.C. Giurescu, `Les relations des pays roumains avec Trébizonde aux XIVe-XIXe siècles', *Révue Roumaine d'Histoire* 13 (1974), pp. 239-246. See also E.T. Kyriakidis, *Bιογραφίαι Λογίων* (Athens 1897) and G.T. Kandilaptis, *AP* 27 (1966), pp. 112, 115, 116, 118, 121, and *AP* 28 (1967), pp. 127, 133, 144.

A list of mines in Chaldia can be found in Kandilaptis,  $\lambda \rho \chi \iota \mu \varepsilon \tau \alpha \lambda \lambda o \nu \rho \gamma o \iota$ , pp. 32-34, where 25 of the sites referred to are outside Pontos.

**For European travellers** who visited Argana and Kapan, and the mines of Asia Minor in general in the 19th century: C. Issawi, *The Economic History of Turkey 1800-1914* (Chicago/London 1980), pp. 278 *ff*. See also D.P. Phosteris, `To Μεταλλεῖον τοῦ Ταύۅου', *MCh* 9 (1961), pp. 246-261; I. Papapetros, *Τστορικὴ καὶ Λαογραφικὴ Μελέτη τοῦ Μεταλλείου*  $\Sigma i \mu$  (Thessaloniki, n.d.), and D. Quataert, *Social Disintegration and Popular Resistance in the Ottoman Empire 1881-1908* (New York 1983), pp. 60 and 65-66.

The scholarly name Argyropolis was rarely used and was soon replaced by the more common Argyroupolis.

**Chalice**: Oikonomidis, *AP* 3 (1931), between pages 184-185. For the inscription see Chatzidaki, *MCh* 8 (1959), pp. 7-8, no. 27. For chalices in general, see: *Oro di Venezia, 6<sup>a</sup> Mostra dell' Oreficeria, Gioielleria, Argentaria* (Venice 1983), pp. 185-190; *Le trésor de Saint-Marc de Venise* (exhibition catalogue, Milan 1984), pp. 156-165, nos 15-16. For Phytiana, see: G.T. Kandilaptis, *Tà* Φντίανα (Thessaloniki 1949), pp. 11, 58, 64-67, and A. Bryer, J. Isaac and D. Winfield, `Nineteenth-Century Monuments in the City and Vilayet of Trebizond: Architectural and Historical Notes', *AP* 32 (1973/74), pp. 219-227.

**Flabella**: Chatzidaki, *MCh* 8 (1959), pp. 11-12, no. 42, and D. Pallas, `΄Η Θεοτόκος Ζωοδόχος Πηγή. Εἰκονογραφικὴ Ἀνάλυση καὶ Ἱστορία τοῦ Θέματος', Ἀρχαιολογικὸν Δελτίον 26 (1971), Μελέται (Athens 1973), pp. 202, 212, 215-216, pl. 51. For the pierced-work designs, see: H. Tait, *Clocks and Watches* (London 1986), figs 45-46; cf. also *Splendeur de Byzance* (exhibition catalogue, Brussels 1982), pp. 157, 0.24, and *The Anatolian Civilisations III* (exhibition catalogue, Istanbul 1983), pp. 265, E 270. For Ignatios Kouthouris, see: Kandilaptis, *AP* 27 (1966), p. 115, n. 1, and G.T. Kandilaptis, *AP* 24 (1961), p. 141.

**Choutoura cross**: Chatzidaki, *MCh* 8 (1959), p. 5 no. 14. For carved wooden crosses, see: B. Radojkovic3, *Les objets sculptés d'art mineur en Serbie ancienne* (Belgrade 1977), and Yiota Oikonomaki-Papadopoulou, 'Church Silverwork', in *Patmos. Treasures of the Monastery*, A.D. Kominis (ed.) (Athens 1988), pp. 227-228. For 16th-century church silver and especially for a chalice made by a Pontian craftsman, see: Anna Ballian, 'Έκκλησιαστικὰ Ἀσημικὰ ἀπὸ τὴν Κωνσταντινούπολη καὶ ὁ Πατριαρχικὸς Θρόνος τοῦ Ἱερεμία B'', *DKMS* 7 (1991), pp. 51-73. See also: Jennings, in *Continuity*, pp. 134-136, 138-142; *Νέον Μαρτυρολόγιον Όσίου Νικοδείμου τοῦ Ἀγιορείτου* (Athens 1961), pp. 71-74; A.G. Paspatis, Υπόμνημα περὶ τοῦ Γραικικοῦ Nοσοκομείου τῶν Ἐπτὰ Πύργων (Athens 1863), pp. 141, 294. For the Choutoura Monastery: Bryer, Isaac and Winfield, *AP* 32 (1973/74), pp. 158-176.

**Rose-water sprinkler**: For an example of an Islamic rose-water sprinkler see: E. Atil, *Renaissance of Islam, Art of the Mamluks* (Washington, D.C. 1981), p. 98, no. 31. For the title, see: T. Papadopoullos, *Studies and Documents relating to the History of the Greek Church and People under Turkish Domination* (Brussels 1952), p. 74. For the donor: N. Veis, *AP* 14 (1949), p. 129. For Trapezuntine goldsmiths: Evliya-Hammer, p. 48. For the 1670 flask see: *Greece and the Sea*, (A. Delivorrias (ed.), Athens 1987), p. 370 no. 280.

**Gospel-book**: *Βυζαντιν*ή καὶ Μεταβυζαντινή Τέχνη (exhibition catalogue; Athens 1986), p. 201, no. 225; D. Drumev, Orfévrerie (in Bulgarian; Sofia 1976), figs 36-38; Lila Marangou, *Amorgos Monastery of the Virgin Chozoviotissa* (Athens 1988), fig. 24, and D. Haldane, *Islamic Bookbindings* (London 1983). For Transylvanian influence in the silver-work, see: C. Nicolescu, *Lay and Liturgical Silver from the Romanian Principalities (14th-19th Centuries)* (in Romanian; Bucharest 1968), figs 91, 104; Anna Ballian, `Απὸ τὰ Κειμήλια τῆς Ἀργυρούπολης', *Tὰ Νέα τῶν Φίλων τοῦ Μουσείου Μπενάκη* (July-September 1988), pp. 15-22. For the donor: G.T. Kandilaptis, *AP* 24 (1961), p. 147.

**Embroidery with Saint Gregory of Nyssa:** Evgenia Vei-Chatzidaki, Ἐκκλησιαστικὰ *Κεντήματα* (Athens 1953), pp. 47-48, no. 59, pl. KZ<sup>2</sup>; M.S. Theochari, Ἐκκλησιαστικὰ *Χρυσοκέντητα* (Athens 1986), p. 6. For saints under an arcade, see e.g. the Trapezuntine casket in *Le trésor de Venise*, pp. 201-3, no. 27 [in the present work, Fig. 209a, b, pp. 266-267]. For 17th-century persecutions in Pontos, see: Chrysanthos, *AP* 4-5 (1933), pp. 711-713.

**Embroidery with Saint George**: E. Vei-Chatzidaki, Ἐκκλησιαστικὰ Κεντήματα, pp. 35-37, no. 48, pl. KA.

Pectoral: Unpublished. Benaki Museum, Inv. no. 14111.

**Cross**: See Oikonomidis, *AP* 3 (1931), between pages 184-185. Benaki Museum, Inv. no. *TA* 187.

**More recent works on Argyroupolis**: Anna Ballian, 'Argana on the Tigris and Vank on the Euphrates: Pontic Mining Expansion and Church Silver from Argyroupolis-Gümüşhane', in the collective work,  $\Theta \nu \mu (\alpha \mu \alpha \sigma \tau \eta \mu \nu \eta \mu \eta \tau \eta \zeta \Lambda \alpha \sigma \kappa \alpha \rho (\nu \alpha \zeta M \pi o \nu \rho \alpha)$  (Benaki Museum, Athens 1994), vol. 1, pp. 15-22; vol. II, fig. II, pp. 7-8. Anna Ballian, *Patronage in Central Asia Minor and the Pontos during the Ottoman Period. The case of Church Silver, 17th-19th Centuries*, PhD thesis, University of Birmingham 1995.