## Byzantine Settlements and Monuments of Cappadocia: A Historiographic Review

Catherine JOLIVET-LÉVY\*

At the 1997 colloquium La Turquie de Guillaume de Jerphanion, organized in Rome, I presented an attempt of status quaestionis of the studies on Byzantine monuments of Cappadocia undertaken after de Jerphanion. The proceedings of this meeting were published by Philippe Luisier the following year in the Mélanges de l'École française de Rome. Moyen âge<sup>1</sup>. With the time elapsed since this review, where do we stand today? In this brief report, I will try to sum up the more recent contributions and suggest a number of perspectives.

I would like to start with some positive points. The renewed interest in Cappadocia, especially evident since the 1980s, has been confirmed, and the region's heritage is now deemed worthy of mention in general syntheses on Byzantine art, as well as in specific studies, especially for its contribution to the study of material culture and realia of Byzantium<sup>2</sup>, or in iconographic studies<sup>3</sup>. A few synthetic essays, whose rarity I deplored in 1997, have been published<sup>4</sup>, facilitating access to a plethora of documentation, which is not easy to approach for someone with no immediate knowledge of the terrain. As a consequence of the different surveys and specific studies undertaken in the region, the archaeological documentation has gradually increased, resulting in brief reports as well as publications of monographic nature.

Knowledge of western Cappadocia has thus been enriched and specified by the research of Albrecht Berger on Mokissos<sup>5</sup>, of Robert Ousterhout on the site of Çanlı kilise and its surroundings<sup>6</sup>, of Veronica Kalas on Selime and Yaprakhisar<sup>7</sup>, and of Rainer Warland on the region of Mamasun<sup>8</sup>. Hanna Wiemer-Enis has described a new church in the valley of Ihlara<sup>9</sup>, and Nicole Thierry a painting from a ruined church of Güzelyurt<sup>10</sup>, of which I have proposed a slightly different reading<sup>11</sup>. Further to the north, Tolga Uyar has studied the paintings of the church of

Gökçetoprak<sup>12</sup>. At the south-east of Ürgüp, the valley of Erdemli, near Yeşilhisar, whose interest was previously pointed out by Thierry and Nathalie Aldehuelo<sup>13</sup>, has been the object of several campaigns carried out by Nilay Karakaya and dedicated primarily to the study of wall paintings in rock-cut churches: apart from her reports on these missions<sup>14</sup>, a number of articles have been published<sup>15</sup>. New discoveries have also been made at Soğanlı<sup>16</sup> and at Başköy<sup>17</sup>, and the survey led since 2009 by Nilüfer Peker and Uyar in the region of Güzelöz (Mavrucan) and Başköy appears very promising<sup>18</sup>. A series of other rock-cut settlements and churches, placed further to the north, have also been discovered and published: near the village of Bahçeli<sup>19</sup>, in Tatlarin<sup>20</sup>, Uçhisar<sup>21</sup>, and Göreme<sup>22</sup>.

- \* English translation by Svetlana Sobkovitch.
- <sup>1</sup> Jolivet-Lévy 1998a; see also Thierry 1998a.
- <sup>2</sup> Suffice it to cite Parani 2003; Ball 2005; Grotowski 2010.
- <sup>3</sup> See, for example, Meyer 2009a; eadem 2009b.
- Jolivet-Lévy 2001a; Thierry 2002. For a more general approach, see Akyürek 2000.
- <sup>5</sup> Berger 1998.
- <sup>6</sup> Ousterhout 1999; idem 2005.
- <sup>7</sup> Kalas 2000; eadem 2006.
- 8 Warland 2008. For Ovaören and Gökçetoprak, see also Warland 2011.
- <sup>9</sup> Wiemer-Enis/Horn 1998.
- <sup>10</sup> Thierry 2009.
- Jolivet-Lévy 2009a.
- <sup>12</sup> Uyar 2010, 620-621; *idem* 2011; *idem*, in press.
- Aldehuelo 2003; Thierry 1989.
- <sup>14</sup> Karakaya 2003; eadem 2004; eadem 2005; eadem 2006.
- <sup>15</sup> Thierry 2006; Karakaya 2008; eadem 2010a; eadem 2011.
- <sup>16</sup> Blanchard/Couprie 2002; Karakaya 2010b.
- <sup>17</sup> Jolivet-Lévy 2005; Jolivet-Lévy/Úyar 2006.
- <sup>18</sup> Peker/Uyar 2011.
- <sup>19</sup> Jolivet-Lévy 2007a; Jolivet-Lévy/Lemaigre Demesnil 2009.
- <sup>20</sup> Jolivet-Lévy 2001b; Uyar 2010, 622-625.
- For this on-going study, see Jolivet-Lévy 2007b.
- Thierry 2004; Jolivet-Lévy/Lemaigre Demesnil 2005.

Churches and their painted programmes, which are our main - and often unique - source of information about the patrons and users of rock-cut monuments, and consequently, on the society of which they are an expression, and on the context of which they are part, continuously account for an important share of studies on Cappadocia<sup>23</sup>. New propositions on the dating of the oldest programmes have been made by Maria Xenaki in the framework of her doctoral thesis<sup>24</sup>, while Uvar has re-evaluated the paintings of the thirteenth century, enriching the known corpus of new programmes and defining their place in the social, economic, and political environment of Cappadocia under the Seljuks<sup>25</sup>. Despite the contempt often shown today for studies of churches and of their wall paintings<sup>26</sup>, these remain an essential source of information, not only about the artistic expression, but also for the society and history of the region. The wealth of iconographic repertory preserved in Cappadocia, offering, in many cases, examples of iconography

<sup>23</sup> See, for example, Jolivet-Lévy 1998b; eadem 2001c; eadem 2002; eadem 2009b; Tsakalos 2012. See also the doctoral dissertations defended in Paris by A. Tsakalos (2006), M. Xenaki (2011), and T. Uyar (2011).

which are more precocious or abundant than in other regions of the Byzantine world, has made possible new syntheses and specific studies<sup>27</sup>.

If wall paintings have always represented an important field of research, they are no longer approached in the same manner, and this, since a good twenty years. The analyses of iconographic programmes have become more subtle, joining the studies of the relations between architecture, imagery, and liturgy, the role of the patron and the function of place, the questions of conception and perception. Research has also involved the organization of 'workshops', the identity and social status of painters, and the material conditions of their activity<sup>28</sup>. Traditional studies of style are completed nowadays by the analysis of painterly techniques, down to the plastering and pigment specifics<sup>29</sup>. An ambitious project, headed by Maria Andaloro, is underway since 2007 to set up a database of wall painting materials and techniques; to this day, analyses have primarily concerned the paintings of the Church of the Forty Martyrs at Şahinefendi<sup>30</sup>, but one can hope to see other monuments given the same attention. The value of this endeavour is obvious, considering that our knowledge of iconography and style has significantly progressed over the past fifty years, while that about materials and painting techniques has remained quite limited. The study of churches and of their painted decoration thus remains a fundamental component of research on Cappadocia, and its contribution cannot be denied.

Yet, a positive aspect of research on Cappadocia since the last fifteen years has been the diversification of subjects and approaches, which was already apparent when I established my report in 1997, and this tendency has been confirmed since then. Religious architecture - both rock-cut31 and masonry churches<sup>32</sup> – as well as sculpted decoration<sup>33</sup>, have given rise to more profound studies. Carving techniques have been the subject of a small book by Gül Öztürk<sup>34</sup>. But the most remarkable phenomenon is the shift of interest from the study of churches and monasteries towards secular complexes and their topographical contexts. Domestic architecture has been identified on many sites, especially in western Cappadocia<sup>35</sup>. Residences, often qualified as 'aristocratic', of which some had been - and still are sometimes - considered as monasteries, have been described, shedding an interesting new light on habitations, villages, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Xenaki 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Uvar 2011.

Suffice it to quote here, as an example, Veronica Kalas (2009a, 150): "During the twentieth century, a focus by art historians on the hundreds of painted Byzantine churches in Cappadocia is largely responsible for the perturbation of this outlook of the region".

Jolivet-Lévy 2006; eadem 2007c; eadem 2008. On the donors, see Karamaouna/Peker/Uyar 2014; and the general article by Maria Andaloro (2011). On the funerary installations and iconography, see Weissbrod 2003.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Xenaki 2011, 488-543; Uyar 2011, 383-527; Jolivet-Lévy, in press<sup>1</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Thierry 2003; Wisseman/Sarin/Ousterhout 2002; Restle 2007.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Andaloro 2008; and the following reports in *Araştırma Sonuçları Toplantısı* 26 (2009), II, 187-200; 28 (2011), III, 155-172; as well as in *Arkeometri Sonuçları Toplantısı* 24 (2009), 307-316; 25 (2010), 517-533, 535-552; 26 (2011), 147-160.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Lemaigre Demesnil 2010.

<sup>32</sup> Ousterhout 2004.

<sup>33</sup> Lemaigre Demesnil 2002; eadem 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Öztürk 2009.

Mathews/Daskalakis-Mathews 1997 has played a decisive role in the identification of these complexes. See Ousterhout 2005; Kalas 2000; eadem 2006; Warland 2008; idem 2011.

social contexts. In this regard, the book by Ousterhout on Çanlı kilise has been a turning point: for the first time, systematic survey and description embraced an entire site, with a view to determining the nature of this rock-cut settlement, thus bringing up a series of questions - still open today - on the distinction between secular and monastic architecture, and consequently, on the function of such complexes<sup>36</sup>. The author concludes that it was a prosperous town lodging the military of the garrison stationed at the neighbouring fortress of Akhisar, landowners, civil and ecclesiastical officials, as well as a population of a more modest background. Numerous studies enter into the same line, the most important being those of Kalas on Selime and Yaprakhisar, which pay special attention not only to 'ceremonial' spaces, but also to utilitarian rooms such as kitchens<sup>37</sup>, and of Warland on Mamasun<sup>38</sup>. Rock-cut monuments of Açıksaray, already described by Lyn Rodley, have also been re-evaluated $^{39}$ .

Another promising direction of research is the study of rock-cut defensive and agricultural facilities: since 1991, the Centro studi sotterranei of Genova has been exploring in a systematic fashion the artificial cavities of Anatolia with a view to assembling precise documentation (topographical surveys, drawings, photographs) on the studied sites, including those of Cappadocia. Research so far has concerned localization, exploration, and documentation of underground refuge sites to the west of Nevşehir, on the supplementary structures of Derinkuyu, and more generally, on the defence systems in the so-called underground cities of Cappadocia. The Italian team has also been interested in hydraulic systems, indicating collectors, water channels, and gutters excavated in eroded valleys (zone of Göreme), as well as in some agricultural facilities, such as rock-cut apiaries and dovecotes<sup>40</sup>. Water-mills and irrigation systems have also been mentioned on the sites of Güzelöz/Mavrucan<sup>41</sup>. Barns and stables are frequent<sup>42</sup>, as well as wine presses<sup>43</sup>, while grain millstones and furnaces have been rarely reported<sup>44</sup>. Despite the frequent absence of precise chronological reference points, all this documentation is precious for the knowledge of rural life and agricultural activity in the region in the medieval period.

Notwithstanding the accomplished progress, research on the monuments of Cappadocia remains hindered by the absence of consensus on the essen-

tial issues of the rock-cut establishments' chronology and function. For the oldest monuments, research undertaken by Nicole Lemaigre Demesnil has demonstrated the early dating - fifth to seventh centuries – of some churches and settlements<sup>45</sup>. New discoveries confirm this, such as the church of Matiane (Göreme village today), dedicated most probably to St Sergios, where are preserved cryptographic inscriptions from the sixth century; carved by the same workshop as the church 3 of Güllüdere, it allows a sure dating of the latter to the same period<sup>46</sup>. More recently, inscriptions of the sixth century have allowed us to identify a martyrium of St Kerykos at the place called Gorgoli, which owned a sacred source going back to Antiquity<sup>47</sup>. Examples could be multiplied: not only part of the Christian heritage preserved in the region surely dates back to the Early Byzantine period, but one observes, at certain sites, the continuity between pagan and Christian settlements.

As for the emergence of monasticism in Cappadocia, this is not a post-iconoclast phenomenon, as has been often repeated recently, under the pretext that "there is virtually no evidence of monastic settlements that may be securely dated before the tenth century"<sup>48</sup>. Written sources attest to the presence of monks and existence of monasteries in Cappadocia in the fourth-sixth centuries<sup>49</sup>. If no Cappadocian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Ousterhout 2005.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Kalas 2007; eadem 2009a; eadem 2009b; Öztürk 2012.

<sup>38</sup> Warland 2008.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Grishin 2002, 167-171; Öztürk 2010.

Medieval dovecotes, first pointed out by Guy Demenge (1995), have been mentioned on many sites, as at the Çanlı kilise settlement, but a comprehensive study is still lacking. Among the numerous publications by the Italian team since 1997, see Bixio/Castellani 2000; Bixio/Castellani/Succhiarelli 2002; Bixio/Dal Cin/Traverso 2002; Bixio/Bologna/Traverso 2004; Decker 2007.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Peker/Uyar 2011.

<sup>42</sup> Tütüncü 2008.

<sup>43</sup> Aldehuelo 2003; Jolivet-Lévy/Lemaigre Demesnil 2009; Karakaya 2008; Peker/Uyar 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Aldehuelo 2003; Karakaya 2008.

<sup>45</sup> Lemaigre Demesnil 2010.

Jolivet-Lévy/Lemaigre Demesnil 2005.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Jolivet-Lévy/Kiourtzian 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> See, for example, Ousterhout 2013, 92-93; *idem* 2011, 5; Kalas 2009a, 147: "given that not a single Byzantine source of any era refers to the region as one of ascetism or monasticism, it is surprising that modern scholars continue to endorse this interpretation".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> See Métivier 2005, 365-366.

monk is lauded in this period for his asceticism or reclusive ways, the communal way of life, as preached by St Basil, is attested, and many monks of Cappadocia are known to leave their homeland (and their monastery) for Palestine, Syria, and Egypt, striving for a life of isolation and asceticism. Monks hailing from Cappadocia were instrumental in the establishment of *lavras* and coenobitic monasteries of Palestine, the first among them being St Sabas, the founder of the *lavra* bearing his name. To be sure, monasteries were not very numerous in Early Byzantine Cappadocia, but they were not absent either, as is also confirmed by archaeological remains<sup>50</sup>.

The chronology of the oldest wall paintings is more difficult to establish, and the dating of some murals to the pre-iconoclast period remains controversial. The question has been recently re-examined by Xenaki, who introduced new arguments in favour of a later date - the ninth century - for programmes previously attributed to the sixthninth centuries<sup>51</sup>. In any case, it seems that the question is not definitely resolved, and that the existence of paintings dating back to the seventh century cannot be excluded, but further research, and maybe findings, are needed to ascertain this. The issue of the role of iconoclasm equally remains open to discussion, but in our opinion, decorative programmes which might be related to Byzantine iconoclasm are extremely rare<sup>52</sup>.

See, for example, Jolivet-Lévy/Lemaigre Demesnil 2001; Lemaigre Demesnil 2010, 10-15 (Özkonak), 37-41 (Güllüdere 3), 107-112 (Balkan dere 3), 119-135 (Archangelos at Cemil). The discovery, at some sites (Archangelos at Cemil, Bahçeli, Çat, etc.), of monastic cells, is not taken into consideration by Ousterhout and Kalas.

51 Xenaki 2011.

<sup>53</sup> On this question, see Thierry 1995.

There is also the question of break or continuity in the rural life and monumental activity in the time of the Arab raids<sup>53</sup>. Studies undertaken at various sites have produced contrasting results: if abandonment can be established for some of them, others reveal traces of activity which was on-going or resumed in the ninth-tenth centuries. Palaeoecological investigation of the sediments from the volcanic Nar lake, realized as a collaborative and interdisciplinary research project<sup>54</sup>, has provided new chronological indices, which complement data from other sources, documentary as well as archaeological. Landscape ecological changes between Antiquity and our time, in this region close to Nazianzos/Nenezi, have revealed a period of decline in agricultural activities (grain and trees growing, cattle breeding) from the years 664/678 to the end of the ninth century, or the period which coincides with that of Arab armies' expeditions. Starting with this date - the end of the ninth century - grain growing and stock-raising are expanding again for two centuries, until the arrival of the Turks. These results corroborate data from the historical sources: though the impact of Arab expeditions on demographic decrease and economic decline should probably not be overestimated<sup>55</sup>, the raids were certainly an aggravating factor in the decline of activities. Nevertheless, these results do not allow evaluating the proportions of this decline: economic evolution does not imply the desertification and abandonment of the region, as is attested by the creation of the themes of Cappadocia, at the turn of the eighth and ninth centuries, and of Charsianon in the second part of the ninth century, as well as by some seals which can be dated by end of the seventh and the eighth century<sup>56</sup>.

Another apple of discord: the thirteenth century. The 'German school', represented by Marcell Restle<sup>57</sup>, Wiemer-Enis<sup>58</sup>, and Warland<sup>59</sup>, continues to attribute the climax of monumental and artistic activity in Cappadocia to the period of Seljuk rule, in the thirteenth century, dating to this time, on grounds that remain essentially stylistic, the churches which have been until now attributed to the tenth (the New Tokalı, for example) and the eleventh century (the 'column churches' at Göreme). Meanwhile, studies conducted by Uyar on a corpus of programmes whose thirteenth-century dating is incontestable<sup>60</sup>, as some are dated by inscriptions, and the discovery of a new dedication dated by 1217-1219 in the catholicon of Cemil

For the attribution of decorations to the iconoclast period, see Thierry 1998b. The monuments of Cappadocia are literally excluded from the discussion of iconoclasm by Leslie Brubaker (2001; eadem 2004, 581-584, 587-589) and Ousterhout (2001, 4-5, 24-25). Lastly, see Jolivet-Lévy, in press<sup>2</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> England et al. 2008; Eastwood et al. 2009.

As has been shown by Métivier/Prigent 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Métivier/Prigent 2010; Métivier 2009a, 71-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Restle 1988.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Wiemer-Enis 1998; eadem 2000.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Warland 2000a; *idem* 2000b.

<sup>60</sup> Uyar 2010; idem 2011.

monastery<sup>61</sup>, have introduced new data on the thirteenth century and allowed, at the same time, to establish a more precise relative chronology of paintings, and to propose the identification of workshops active in the region at the time. One can hope, therefore, that a global study of monuments (architecture, sculpture, paintings, technique, iconography, and style, but also inscriptions), connected to their historical context, and confronted with comparative material from other regions, allows to proceed with the chronology of rock-cut settlements of Cappadocia, providing a more solid basis for it.

Identification of the nature and function of rock-cut complexes is still more delicate. The same organization of rock-cut spaces, often around a courtyard, is characteristic, indeed, of both secular residences and monasteries. If the absence of a church obviously indicates a non-ecclesiastical complex, other criteria which have been put forward such as the place of the church or the absence of a refectory with a carved table - are not decisive. The attribution of these mansions to the Cappadocian 'aristocracy' is also questionable: would not grand landowners and military officers of high rank rather have commissioned regular masonry houses, gone today? Despite the paucity of evidence, built architecture existed in Cappadocia, nowadays destroyed or still buried underground.

In any case, attention to secular architecture and identification of housing structures have been crucial for advancing the knowledge of Byzantine Cappadocia, and this has been accepted by everybody. So, is there still a need today to keep circulating a so-called monastic myth in order to demonstrate the value of this new perspective<sup>62</sup>? It has been a long time, indeed, that Cappadocia is not considered anymore, in scholarly works, as a holy land inhabited by monks and hermits, with the exception maybe of some research in the English language<sup>63</sup> and of works for a general public. One cannot help, therefore, being surprised at reading statements along the lines of "Although Lucas was active in the early eighteenth century, his perception of Cappadocia reflects the norm of interpretation until the present day"64, which are injurious to the research undertaken in the past fifty years<sup>65</sup>. If it has been agreed for decades that Cappadocia was a monastic land no more than any other region throughout the Byzantine Empire, this does not allow, however, to deny the significant role of

monasticism. Insufficient knowledge of the terrain and, simultaneously, of the francophone research, can explain statements which do not take into account either the archaeological reality or data from historical sources.

I am not going back to the aforementioned supposition attributing the emergence of Cappadocian monasticism to the Middle Byzantine period. Evidence of refectories' multiplication at Göreme has recently prompted Ousterhout to propose a new hypothesis: monasticism could have developed in Cappadocia "in response to broader social concerns of the middle Byzantine period, such as the rise of powerful families and the commemoration of the dead"66, these refectories being understood as spaces used for commemorative meals for the dead (refrigeria). This hypothesis raises difficulties. First of all, the majority of ensembles (monastic or not) dotting the Cappadocian countryside cannot be related to the provincial elite of powerful landowners, on the rise in the course of the tenth century: these are small complexes, which could have been founded by peasants on their land, probably, indeed, for burial purposes, and to ensure monks' prayer; their life-span appears quite ephemeral. Besides, was not the obsession with death, ascribed to the inhabitants of Cappadocia, a preoccupation of any medieval person, while it is solely owing to the conservation conditions that the region gives the impression of a higher concentration of funerary installations? Why is it that the supposedly growing importance of commemorative services for the dead would have led to the multiplication of refectories only in a single, well-defined zone of the rupestrian region, at Göreme? Finally, the hypothesis takes little heed of the modifications caused by the passing of time and erosion: isolated today, these refectories could be linked to other rooms or to chapels since destroyed or buried in the ground.

<sup>61</sup> Kiourtzian 2008; Uyar 2008.

<sup>62</sup> Above all, in Kalas 2004; eadem 2009a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Kostof 1972.

<sup>64</sup> Kalas 2009a, 150.

 <sup>65</sup> It would be enough to refer, for example, to a general-public work such as Jolivet-Lévy 1997, 69, 80 and passim.
66 Ousterhout 2010; idem 2005, 5. The hypothesis is essentially founded on the great number of funerary structures, already emphasized by A. Grishin (2002, 167), and on the presence of numerous refectories without visible association to churches.

Identification of monasteries in Cappadocia remains an open question, and should be treated on a case-by-case basis. The situation varies, indeed, from one site to another, and the study of rock-cut complexes in all their diversity should lead to a picture far more nuanced than the one offered to us today. If 'residences', studied by Ousterhout and Kalas, can be identified at numerous sites of western Cappadocia, the majority of rock-cut complexes preserved in the region of Ürgüp are quite different. No doubt, the countless churches strewing the Cappadocian countryside were not all attached to monasteries, but most cannot either be interpreted as private chapels of 'aristocratic residences'. They are rather the result of private initiative by modest commissioners, founding a family chapel, often for burial purposes, which could - or not - carry an attachment of a small monastery, and these little foundations were in all likelihood rather ephemeral.

The rare excavations underway in the region do not concern rock-cut establishments. For that of Şahinefendi, see: Yenipınar 2003; Yenipınar/Gülyaz/Tutar 2006. For Göreme at Mt. Argaeus, see: Karakaya 2010c. For Tyana (Kemerhisar), see: Berges/Nollé 2000; Rosada 2004; *idem* 2005; Rosada/Lachin 2008; Rosada *et al.* 2006. Excavations have accompanied the restoration works at the (constructed) church of Eski Andaval: see the reports of M.S. Pekak, in the *Kazı Sonuçları Toplantısı* 20/2 (1998), 502-524; 21/2 (1999), 373-384; 23/2 (2001), 391-400; 24 (2002), 405-414. The same hold true for the on-going restoration of Kızıl kilise: Çelebioğlu/Ağaryılmaz 2008.

Thus L. Jones (2010) rediscovers in the church of Meryemana, at Göreme, five figures which had all of them already been identified by G. de Jerphanion (1925-1942), I, 245-248; or S. Gabelić (2009) on the figures of Archippos and of the archangel, identified in Jolivet-Lévy 1991, 37.

<sup>69</sup> A florilegium in the articles by V. Kalas; see, for example, Kalas 2009a, 151, 153: "These studies [of art historians] are fundamentally guided by the principles of art historical connoisseurship, a method deeply rooted in the nineteenth-century foundations of the discipline...", or elsewhere, carved spaces "are almost always misunderstood as caves, that is naturally formed spaces...", (?!) etc.

We are still lacking a collection of Greek Christian inscriptions known in Cappadocia, but the publication of epigrammatic inscriptions by Andreas Rhoby (2009, 275-303; idem 2010, 403-408), and the project of corpus of graffiti by Maria Xenaki attest to the renewed interest in epigraphic documentation.

As in the fundamental works of Sophie Métivier. See Métivier 2005; 2006; 2008; 2009a; 2009b; Métivier/ Prigent 2010; Métivier 2012. The books by J. E. Cooper and M.J. Decker, *Life and Society in Byzantine Cappadocia*, Basingstoke 2012, and R. Warland, *Byzantinisches Kappa-dokien*, Darmstsadt 2013, came out too late to be considered here. This short historiographic review reveals the undeniable vitality of research, attested by the diversity of recent studies, which give rise to new questions and allow a better evaluation of a part of the archaeological documentation. Fresh lines of investigation are opened. Nevertheless, the progress is not so spectacular, which is explained by a series of factors, starting with the absence of archaeological excavations: the study of settlements, of dwellings, of monastic, funerary, agricultural or defensive structures cannot dispense with archaeology<sup>67</sup>. The very conditions of fieldwork, the absence of cooperation among researchers, and for some, of sufficient knowledge of the terrain, also hinder the advancement of knowledge. More alarming in my opinion is the progressively generalized ignorance of bibliography in the French language, evident in claims to new 'discoveries'68 or in rash and schematic judgments<sup>69</sup>. The archaeological and artistic heritage of Cappadocia is sufficiently rich and varied to be studied from different points of view, and it is a sterile undertaking to oppose different approaches which, far from being mutually exclusive, are - or should be - complementary.

What, finally, are the perspectives for the years to come? In the absence of proper excavations, more surveys and site studies, in different parts of Cappadocia, are required, in order to document the establishments' relationship to their setting in a broad perspective, and to better place the Cappadocian communities within their topographical context. But a comprehensive understanding of the region, of its settlements and monuments is impossible without a global approach which would certainly take into account domestic, utilitarian, and funerary structures, but also churches, their decoration and inscriptions<sup>70</sup>, as well as historical and documentary sources<sup>71</sup>.

## **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Akyürek, E. 2000, 'Byzantine Cappadocia', in: M. Sözen (ed.), *Cappadocia*, Istanbul, 228-395.

Aldehuelo, N. 2003, 'Le monastère byzantin d'Erdemli', *Dossiers d'Archéologie* 283, 72-79.

Andaloro, M. 2008, 'Rock Paintings of Cappadocia: Images, Materials and State of Preservation', *Araştırma Sonuçları Toplantısı* 25/2, 163-178.

Andaloro, M. 2011, 'Committenti dichiarati e committenti senza volto: Costantino, Niceforo, Leone nella Tokalı Kilise in Cappadocia, in Medioevo: i committenti', in: XIII convegno internazionale di studi dell'Associazione Italiana

- Storici dell'Arte Medievale (Parma, 21-26 settembre 2010), Milan, 67-86.
- Ball, J.L. 2005, Byzantine Dress: Representations of Secular Dress in Eighth- to Twelfth-Century Painting, Basingstoke.
- Berger, A. 1998, 'Viranşehir (Mokisos), eine byzantinische Stadt in Kappadokien', *Istanbuler Mitteilungen* 48, 349-429.
- Berges, D., J. Nollé 2000, *Tyana*, I-II, Bonn (Inschriften griechischer Städte aus Kleinasien 55).
- Bixio, R., G. Bologna, M. Traverso 2004, 'Cappadocia 2003: gli apiari rupestri dell'Altopiano Centrale Anatolico (Turchia)', *Opera Ipogea* 1, 3-18.
- Bixio, R., V. Castellani 2000, 'Insediamenti sotterranei e pianificazione idrogeologica nell'antica e nell'attuale Cappadocia', in: M. Campagnoli, A. Recanatini (eds), *Atti Convegno* di Studi di Camerino "La memoria del sottosuolo", 17/18 Luglio 1999, Camerano, 58-71.
- Bixio, R., V. Castellani, C. Succhiarelli (eds) 2002, *Cappadocia, le città sotterranee*, Rome.
- Bixio, R., F. Dal Cin, M. Traverso 2002, 'Cappadocia: un apiario rupestre', *Opera Ipogea* 2, 17-28.
- Blanchard, R., P. Couprie 2002, 'Le réfectoire de Geyikli kilise à Soğanlı (Cappadoce): essai d'interprétation', CArch 50, 93-104.
- Brubaker, L. 2001, 'On the Margins of Byzantine Iconoclasm', in: XXe Congrès International des Études Byzantines. Collège du France Sorbonne, 19-25 août 2001. Pré-Actes, Paris, 209-216.
- Brubaker, L. 2004, 'Aniconic Decoration in the Christian World (6th-11th Century): East and West', Settimane di Studio della Fondazione Centro Italiano di Studi sull'Alto Medioevo 51, 573-590.
- Çelebioğlu, B., I. Ağaryılmaz 2008, 'Kapadokya'da Kızıl kilise', Megaron. YTÜ Arch.Fac. E-Journal 3/2, 155-161.
- Decker, J. 2007, 'Settlement and Economy in the Byzantine East', DOP 61, 217-267.
- Demenge, G. 1995, 'Turquie: pigeonniers et ruchers byzantins de Cappadoce', *Archéologia* 311, 42-51.
- Eastwood, W.J., O. Gümüşçü, H. Yiğitbaşioğlu, A. England 2009, 'Integrating Palaeoecological and Archaeo-Historical Records: Land Use and Landscape Change in Cappadocia (Central Turkey) since Late Antiquity', in: Vorderstrasse/Roodenberg 2009, 45-69.
- England, A., W.J. Eastwood, C.N. Roberts, R. Turner, J.F. Haldon 2008, 'Historical Landscape Change in Cappadocia (Central Turkey): a Palaeoecological Investigation of Annually-Laminated Sediments from Nar lake', *The Holocene* 18/8, 1229-1245.
- Gabelić, S. 2009, 'Iz programme crkve Svetog Jovana (Ajvali kilise) u Kapadokiji', *Zograf* 33, 33-41.
- Grishin, A. 2002, 'Açık Saray and Medieval Military Campaigns', in: L. Rasmussen, V. Spear, D. Tillotson (eds), Our Medieval Heritage: Essays in Honor of John Tillotson for his 60th Birthday, Cardiff, 164-171.
- Grotowski, P.L. 2010, Arms and Armour of the Warrior Saints: Tradition and Innovation in Byzantine Iconography, 843-1261, Leiden/Boston.
- Jerphanion, G. de 1925-1942, Une nouvelle province de l'art byzantin. Les églises rupestres de Cappadoce, 2 vols, Paris.

- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 1991, Les églises byzantines de Cappadoce. Le programme iconographique de l'abside et de ses abords, Paris.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 1997, La Cappadoce. Mémoire de Byzance, Paris. Jolivet-Lévy, C. 1998a, 'La Cappadoce après Jerphanion. Les monuments byzantins des Xe-XIIIe siècles', Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome 110/2, 899-930 (repr. in: Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2002, Études cappadociennes, London, II).
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 1998b, 'Çarıklı kilise, l'église de la Précieuse Croix à Göreme (Korama), Cappadoce: une fondation des Mélissènoi?', Εὐψυχία. Mélanges offerts à Hélène Ahrweiler, Paris, 301-316 (Byzantina Sorbonensia 16) (repr. in: Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2002, Études cappadociennes, London, XI).
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2001a, La Cappadoce médiévale. Images et spiritualité, s.l.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2001b, 'Art chrétien en Anatolie turque: le témoignage de peintures inédites à Tatlarin', in: A. Eastmond (ed.), Eastern Approaches to Byzantium. XXXIII Spring Symposium of Byzantine Studies, Warwick 1999, Aldershot, 133-145 (repr. in: Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2002, Études cappadociennes, London, VIII).
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2001c, 'Images et espace cultuel à Byzance: l'exemple de Karşı kilise, Cappadoce (1212)', Le sacré et son inscription dans l'espace à Byzance et en Occident. Études comparées, Paris, 163-181 (Byzantina Sorbonensia 18) (repr. in: Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2002, Études cappadociennes, London, IX).
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2002, 'Aspects de la relation entre espace liturgique et décor peint à Byzance', Art, Cérémonial et Liturgie au Moyen Age, Rome, 71-88 (Études lausannoises d'histoire de l'art 1) (repr. in: Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2002, Études cappadociennes, London, XII).
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2005, 'Églises retrouvées de Başköy (Cappadoce)', Deltion of the Christian Archaeological Society 25, 93-102.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2006, 'Prime rappresentazioni del Giudizio Universale nelle Cappadocia bizantina', in: V. Pace (ed.), Alfa e Omega. Il Giudizio Universale tra Oriente e Occidente, Milan, 47-51.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2007a, 'Nouvelles données sur le IXe siècle en Cappadoce: l'église d'Îçeridere', Zbornik Radova Vizantološkog Instituta 44, 73-86.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2007b, 'La Cappadoce aux VIIe-IXe siècles: quelques nouveaux témoignages archéologiques', in: A.C. Quintavalle (ed.), Medioevo Mediterraneo: l'Occidente, Bisanzio e l'Islam. Atti del Convegno Internazionale di Studi, Parma, 21-25 settembre 2004, Parma, 52-60.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2007c, 'Note sur la représentation du Mandylion dans les églises byzantines de Cappadoce', in: *Intorno al Sacro Volto. Genova, Bisanzio e il Mediterraneo (secoli XI-XIV)*, Venice, 137-144 (Collana del Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florenz Max-Planck-Institut 11).
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2008, 'Saint Théodore et le dragon: nouvelles données', in: E. Cuozzo et al. (eds), Puer Apuliae. Mélanges Jean-Marie Martin, Paris, 357-371 (Centre de recherche d'histoire et civilisation de Byzanze. Monographies 30).
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2009a, 'Les cavaliers de Karbala', Zograf 33, 19-31.

- Jolivet-Lévy, C. 2009b, 'The Bahattın samanliği kilisesi at Belisırma revisited', in: C. Hourihane (ed.), Byzantine Art: Recent Studies, Princeton, NJ, 81-110.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. (in press¹), 'Nouvelles données sur les ateliers locaux en Cappadoce byzantine', in: *Terra di roccia e pittura. La Cappadocia e il Mediterraneo*, Viterbo.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C. (in press²), 'De l'aniconisme en Cappadoce: quelques réflexions à la lumière de découvertes récentes', in: L'aniconisme dans l'art sacré byzantin. Actes du colloque de Genève, 1-4 Octobre 2009, Geneva.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C., G. Kiourtzian 2013, 'Le site de Gorgoli et le martyrium de saint Kèrykos en Cappadoce. Étude préliminaire' in: Mélanges Jean-Pierre Caillet. Hortus artium medievalium.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C., N. Lemaigre Demesnil 2001, 'Recherches récentes sur le monastère rupestre de l'Archangélos, près de Cemil', in: Z. Skhirtladze (ed.), Desert Monasticism. Gareja and the Christian East. Papers from the International Symposium Tbilisi University 2000, Tbilisi, 167-189.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C., N. Lemaigre Demesnil (with participation of D. Feissel, J.-L. Fournet) 2005, 'Saint-Serge de Matianè. Son décor sculpté et ses inscriptions', Ars auro gemmisque prior. Mélanges en hommage à Jean-Pierre Caillet, Zagreb, 463.478
- Jolivet-Lévy, C., N. Lemaigre Demesnil 2009, 'Un établissement monastique rural près du village de Bahçeli (Cappadoce)', in: Vorderstrasse/Roodenberg 2009, 85-107.
- Jolivet-Lévy, C., T. Uyar 2006, 'Peintures du XIIIe s. en Cappadoce: Saint-Nicolas de Başköy', Deltion of the Christian Archaeological Society 27, 147-158.
- Jones, L. 2010, 'The Fresco Program of Meryemana: A Reevaluation', ECA 7, 43-57.
- Kalas, V. 2000, Rock-Cut Architecture of the Peristrema Valley: Society and Settlement in Byzantine Cappadocia, unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, New York University.
- Kalas, V. 2004, 'Early Explorations of Cappadocia and the Monastic Myth', Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies 28, 101-119.
- Kalas, V. 2006, 'The 2004 Survey of the Byzantine Settlement at Selime-Yaprakhisar in the Peristrema Valley, Cappadocia', DOP 60, 271-293.
- Kalas, V. 2007, 'Cappadocia's Rock-cut Courtyard Complexes: a Case Study for Domestic Architecture in Byzantium', in: L. Lavan, L. Özgenel, A. Sarantis (eds), *Housing in Late Antiquity: From Palaces to Shops*, Leiden, 393-414.
- Kalas, V. 2009a, 'Challenging the Sacred Landscape of Byzantine Cappadocia', in: A. Walker, A. Luyster (eds), Negotiating Secular and Sacred in Medieval Art: Christian, Islamic, and Buddhist, Aldershot, 147-173.
- Kalas, V. 2009b, 'The Byzantine Kitchen in the Domestic Complexes of Cappadocia', in: Vorderstrasse/Roodenberg 2009, 109-127.
- Karakaya, N. 2003, '2002 Yılı, Kayseri Yeşilhisar İlçesi Erdemli Köyü'ndeki Kaya Kiliseleri Duvar Resimleri', *Araştırma* Sonuçları Toplantısı 21/2, 17-28.
- Karakaya, N. 2004, '2003 Yılı, Kayseri Yeşilhisar İlçesi Erdemli Köyü'ndeki Kaya Kiliseleri Duvar Resimleri', *Araştırma* Sonuçları Toplantısı 22/2, 119-128.

- Karakaya, N. 2005, '2004 Yılı, Kayseri Yeşilhisar İlçesi Erdemli Köyü'ndeki Kaya Kiliseleri Duvar Resimleri', *Araştırma* Sonuçları Toplantısı 23/2, 113-124.
- Karakaya, N. 2006, '2005 Yılı, Kayseri Yeşilhisar İlçesi Erdemli Köyü'ndeki Kaya Yerleşimi, Yüzey Araştırması', *Araştırma* Sonuçları Toplantısı 24/2, 501-510.
- Karakaya, N. 2008, 'Erdemli'de Ekmek ve Şarap', *Anadolu ve Çevresinde Ortaçağ* 2, 33-52.
- Karakaya, N. 2010a, 'Onikinci ve Onüçüncü Yüzyıllarda, Kayseri'nin Yeşilhisar İlçesi, Erdemli Vadisindeki Bizans Yerleşimi', in: Change in the Byzantine World in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Century. First International Sevgi Gönül Byzantine Studies Symposium, Istanbul 2007, Istanbul, 257-355.
- Karakaya, N. 2010b, 'Soğanlı Vadisi'ndeki Yılanlı Şapel', in: S. Doğan, M. Kadiroğlu (eds), Bizans ve Çevre Kültürler. Prof. Dr. S. Yıldız Ötüken'e Armağan, Istanbul, 124-135.
- Karakaya, N. 2010c, 'Gereme Panagia Kilisesi (2005 Yılı Kazı Sonuçları)', Ortaçağ ve Türk Dönemi Kazıları ve Sanat Tarihi Araştırmaları Sempozyumu Bildirileri 13, 175-183.
- Karakaya, N. 2011, 'Kayseri'nin Yeşilhisar İlçesi, Erdemli Vadisi'ndeki Tek Nefli Arkaik Kilise', in: A. Ceren Erel et al. (eds), Anadolu Kültürlerinde Süreklilik ve Değisim. Dr. A. Mine Kadiroğlu'na Armağan, Ankara, 307-324.
- Karamaouna, N., N. Peker, T. Uyar 2014, 'Female Donors in Thirteenth-Century Wall Paintings in Cappadocia: An Overview', in L. Taeis, M. Mullet, M. Grünbart (eds), Female Founders of Byzantium and Beyond.
- Kiourtzian, G. 2008, 'Une nouvelle inscription de Cappadoce du règne de Théodore 1er Laskaris', Deltion of the Christian Archaeological Society 29, 131-138.
- Kostof, S. 1972, Caves of God: the Monastic Environment of Byzantine Cappadocia, Cambridge, MA/London (revised edn: Caves of God. Cappadocia and its Churches, Oxford/ New York/Toronto 1989).
- Lemaigre Demesnil, N. 2002, 'Sculptures figurées d'époque paléochrétienne en Cappadoce: à propos d'un chapiteau historié inédit', *CArch* 50, 41-50.
- Lemaigre Demesnil, N. 2010, Architecture rupestre et décor sculpté en Cappadoce (Ve-IXe siècle), Oxford (BAR International Series 2093).
- Mathews, Th., A.-Chr. Daskalakis-Mathews 1997, 'Islamic-Style Mansions in Byzantine Cappadocia and the Development of the inverted T-Plan', *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* 56, 294-315.
- Métivier, S. 2005, La Cappadoce (IVe-VIe siècle): une histoire provinciale de l'Empire romain d'Orient, Paris.
- Métivier, S. 2006, 'Le culte de saint Hiérôn', in: B. Caseau, J.-Cl. Cheynet, V. Déroche (eds), *Pèlerinages et lieux saints dans l'antiquité et le moyen âge. Mélanges offerts à Pierre Maraval*, Paris, 263-279 (Centre de recherche d'histoire et civilisation de Byzance. Monographies 23).
- Métivier, S. 2008, 'L'organisation de la frontière arabo-byzantine en Cappadoce (VIIIe-IXe siècle)', in: E. Cuozzo et al. (eds), Puer Apuliae. Mélanges offerts à Jean-Marie Martin, Paris, 433-454 (Centre de recherche d'histoire et civilisation de Byzance. Monographies 30).

- Métivier, S. 2009a, 'Sceaux inédits des musées de Kayseri et de Niğde (Turquie)', *Studies in Byzantine Sigillography* 10, 61-74.
- Métivier, S. 2009b, 'Les Maurozômai, Byzance et le sultanat de Rūm. Note sur le sceau de Jean Comnène Maurozômès', Revue des Études byzantines 67, 197-207.
- Métivier, S. 2012, 'Byzantium in question in 13th-century Seljuk Anatolia'. in: G. Saint-Guillain, D. Stathakopoulos (eds), *Liquid & Multiple: Individuals & Identities in the thirteenth-century Aegean*, Paris, 235-257 (Centre de recherché d'histoire et civilisation de Byzance. Monographies 35).
- Métivier, S., V. Prigent 2010, 'La circulation monétaire dans la Cappadoce byzantine d'après les collections des musées de Kayseri et de Niğde', *Mélanges Cécile Morrisson. Travaux et Mémoires* 16, Paris, 577-618.
- Meyer, M. 2009a, 'Porneia. Quelques considérations sur la représentation du péché de chair dans l'art byzantin', Cahiers de civilisation médiévale 52, 225-243.
- Meyer, M. 2009b, An Obscure Portrait. Imaging Women's Reality in Byzantine Art, London.
- Ousterhout, R. 1999, 'The Aciözü Churches near Çeltek in Western Cappadocia', *CArch* 47, 67-76.
- Ousterhout, R. 2001, 'The Architecture of Iconoclasm: the Buildings', in: L. Brubaker, J. Haldon (eds), *Byzantium in the Iconoclast Era c. 680-850: the Sources*, Aldershot, 3-36.
- Ousterhout, R. 2004, 'The Masonry Churches at Çanlı kilise and the Question of Built Architecture in Byzantine Cappadocia', in: *Metin Ahunbay'a Armağan: Bizans Mimarisi Üzerine Yazılar*, Istanbul, 207-220 (Sanat Tarihi Defterleri 8).
- Ousterhout, R. 2005, A Byzantine Settlement in Cappadocia, Washington, DC.
- Ousterhout, R. 2010, 'Remembering the Dead in Byzantine Cappadocia: the Architectural Settings for Commemoration', in: O. Ioannisian, D. Jolshin (eds), Architecture of Byzantium and Kievan Rus, from the 9th to 12th Centuries, St Petersburg, 89-100.
- Öztürk, F.G. 2009, Rock Carving in Cappadocia from Past to Present, Istanbul.
- Öztürk, F.G. 2010, A Comparative Architectural Investigation of the Middle Byzantine Courtyard Complexes in Açıksaray Cappadocia: Questions of Monastic and Secular Settlement, unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Middle East Technical University, Ankara.
- Öztürk, F.G. 2012, 'The Unusual Separation of Cappadocian Refectories and Kitchens: an Enigma of Architectural History', *Middle East Technical University Journal of the Faculty of Architecture* 29/1, 153-169.
- Parani, M. 2003, Reconstructing the Reality of Images: Byzantine Material Culture and Religious Iconography (11th-15th Centuries), Leiden/Boston.
- Peker, N., T. Uyar 2011, 'Güzelöz-Başköy ve Çevresi Bizans Dönemi Yerleşimleri 2009', *Araştırma Sonuçları Toplantısı* 28/1, 283-302.
- Restle, M. 1988, 'Zum Stil kleinasiatischer Wandmalereien in der 1. Hälfte des 13. Jahrhunderts', in: *Studenica et l'art byzantin autour de l'année 1200*, Belgrade, 349-358.

- Restle, M. 2007, 'Byzantinische Wandmalereitechniken ein Überblick über den augenblicklichen Forschungsstand', Anadolu ve Çevresinde Ortaçağ 1, 81-114.
- Rhoby, A. 2009, Byzantinische Epigramme in inschriftlicher Überlieferung. Bd. 1. Byzantinische Epigramme auf Fresken und Mosaiken, Vienna.
- Rhoby, A. 2010, Byzantinische Epigramme in inschriftlicher Überlieferung. Bd. 2. Byzantinische Epigramme auf Ikonen und Objekten der Kleinkunst, Vienna.
- Rosada, G. 2004, 'Tyana-Kemerhisar archaeological excavations 2003', Kazı Sonuçları Toplantısı 26/2, 157-166.
- Rosada, G. 2005, 'Tyana: una città di frontiera, porta tra Occidente e Oriente/Tyana: Bir Sınır Şehri, Doğu ve Batı Arasındakı Kapı', in: Dall'Eufrate al Mediterraneo/Firat'tan Akdeniz'e, Ankara, 117-123.
- Rosada, G., M.T. Lachin 2008, 'Excavations 2007 at Tyana', Kazı Sonuçları Toplantısı 30/3, 1-16.
- Rosada, G. et al. 2006, 'Tyana/Kemerhisar: Gli scavi 2005', Kazı Sonuçları Toplantısı 28/2, 513-528.
- Thierry, N. 1989, 'Erdemli: une vallée monastique inconnue de Cappadoce. Étude préliminaire', *Zograf* 20, 5-21.
- Thierry, N. 1995, 'De la datation des églises de Cappadoce', Byzantinische Zeitschrift 88, 419-455.
- Thierry, N. 1998a, 'La Cappadoce de l'Antiquité au Moyen Âge', Mélanges de l'École française de Rome 110/2, 867-897.
- Thierry, N. 1998b, 'Topographie ponctuelle de l'iconomachie en Asie Mineure' in: Εὐψυχία. Mélanges offerts à Hélène Abrweiler, Paris, 651-671 (Byzantina Sorbonensia 16).
- Thierry, N. 2002, *La Cappadoce de l'Antiquité au Moyen Age*, Turnhout (Bibliothèque de l'Antiquité tardive 4).
- Thierry, N. 2003, 'Les fonds de lapis-lazuli en peinture monumentale au X° s. en Transcaucasie et en Cappadoce', *Dossiers d'Archéologie* 283, 50-57.
- Thierry, N. 2004, 'L'église au Jugement dernier de Göreme (Göreme n<sup>0</sup> 2b)', in: M. Aspra-Bardabake (ed.), Λαμπηδών. Αφιέρωμα στη μνήμη της Ντούλας Μουρίκη, Athens, 815-828.
- Thierry, N. 2006, 'L'église de Saint-Constantin et des Quarante Martyrs du basilikos kandidatos, Basile Tigori, à Erdemli, Cappadoce', *Deltion of the Christian Archaeo-logical Society* 27, 137-146.
- Thierry, N. 2009, 'Portraits funéraires inédits de deux officiers byzantins morts au combat sur les frontières de la Cappadoce. Étude préliminaire', *Deltion of the Christian Archaeological Society* 30, 169-176.
- Tsakalos, A. 2006, Le monastère rupestre de Karanlık kilise. Monachisme, art et patronage en Cappadoce Byzantine, unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Université Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbonne.
- Tsakalos, A. 2012, 'Art et donation en Cappadoce byzantine: l'église rupestre de Karanlık kilise', in: J.-M. Spieser, E. Yota (eds), Donation et donateurs dans le monde byzantine, Paris, 162-187 (Réalités byzantines 14).
- Tütüncü, F. 2008, The Land of the Beautiful Horses: Stables in Middle Byzantine Cappadocia, Ankara.
- Uyar, T. 2008, 'L'église de l'Archangélos à Cemil: le décor de la nef sud et le renouveau de la peinture byzantine en Cappadoce au début du XIIIe siècle', Deltion of the Christian Archaeological Society 29, 119-129.

- Uyar, T. 2010, 'Thirteenth-Century Painting in Cappadocia: New Evidence', in: Change in the Byzantine World in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Century. First International Sevgi Gönül Byzantine Studies Symposium, Istanbul 2007, Istanbul, 617-625.
- Uyar, T. 2011, Art et société en pays de Rum: les peintures 'byzantines' du XIIIe siècle en Cappadoce, unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Université Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbonne.
- Uyar, T. (in press), 'Un monument inédit de Cappadoce: l'église de Gökçetoprak', in: *Terra di roccia e pittura. La Cappadocia e il Mediterraneo*, Viterbo.
- Vorderstrasse, T., J. Roodenberg (eds) 2009, Archaeology of the Countryside in Medieval Anatolia, Leiden.
- Warland, R. 2000a, 'Das Templon der Neuen Tokalı Kilise in Göreme, Kappadokien', in: B. Borkopp, Th. Steppan (eds), Lithostroton. Studien zur byzantinischen Kunst und Geschichte. Festschrift für Marcell Restle, Stuttgart, 325-332.
- Warland, R. 2000b, 'Deesis-Emmanuel-Maria. Zum Bild-konzept kappadokischer Höhlenkirchen des 13. Jh.', in: G. Koch (ed.), Byzantinische Malerei: Bildprogramme, Ikonographie, Stil. Symposium in Marburg 25.-29.6.1998, Wiesbaden, 365-386.
- Warland, R. 2008, 'Die byzantinische Höhlensiedlung von Gökçe/Momoasson in Kappadokien. Gehöfte, Grabkapellen mit Wandmalerei und ein vermögender Salbölhändler', *Istanbuler Mitteilungen* 58, 347-369.
- Warland, R. 2011, 'Byzantinische Siedlungsspuren in der Region zwischen Gökçe/Momoasson und Gökçetoprak in Kappadokien (Survey 2009)', Araştırma Sonuçları Toplantısı 28/1, 243-259.

- Weissbrod, U. 2003, 'Hier liegt der Knecht Gottes...'. Gräber in byzantinischen Kirchen und ihr Dekor (11 bis 15. Jahrhundert). Unter besonderer Berücksichtigung der Höhlenkirchen Kappadokiens, Wiesbaden.
- Wiemer-Enis, H. 1998, Die Wandmalerei einer kappadokischen Höhlenkirche: die Neue Tokalı in Göreme, Frankfurt.
- Wiemer-Enis, H. 2000, Spätbyzantinische Wandmalerei in den Höhlenkirche Kappadokiens in der Türkei, Petersberg.
- Wiemer-Enis, H., G. Horn 1998, 'Die Kordele kilise in Ihlara – eine neuentdeckte Kirche in Kappadokien', *Istanbuler Mitteilungen* 48, 431-436.
- Wisseman, S.P., S. Sarin, R. Ousterhout et al. 2002, 'Fresco Pigments from Byzantine Cappadocia, Part II', in: E. Jerem, K.T. Biro (eds), Archaeometry 98: Proceedings of the 31st International Symposium on Archaeometry, Oxford, 839-843 (BAR International Series 1043).
- Xenaki, M. 2011, Recherches sur les églises de Cappadoce et leur décor peint (VIe-IXe siècles), unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Université Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbonne.
- Yenipınar, H. 2003, 'Chantier de fouilles et de conservation d'un site au sol de mosaïque au lieu-dit Örenci, village de Şahinefendi', *Dossiers d'Archéologie* 283, 8-9.
- Yenipinar, H., M. Gülyaz, S. Tutar 2006, 'Sobesos antik bir kenti kurtarma kazısı çalısmaları', *Müze Çalısmaları ve Kurtarma kazıları Sempozyumu* 15, 121-136.